Beirut, Ares (2020)

Mr. Youssef Saad Head of Procurement Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform Starco Building, Bloc A, 5<sup>th</sup> floor Omar Daouk Street, Minet El Hosn Sector

Subject: Expenditure Verification of Courts Automation Design and Applications for the

Ministry of Justice CTR ENPI/2012/304-541

Expenditure Verification of supplies for the Courts automation at the MOJ

CTR ENPI/2012/307-786

Reference: Specific Contract n° ENPI/2020/ DLLBN 2 300002030: BDO LLP

Audit Module nos. 2016/96 356 and 2016/96 359

Dear Sir,

This is to inform you that, in accordance with article 20 of Annex I to the Financing Agreement signed on 09.12.2009 between the European Commission and the Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform of the Lebanese Republic, the European Commission is going to carry out an expenditure verification of the above-mentioned contracts.

The Auditor contracted by the European Commission for this engagement is BDO LLP, (Baker Street 55, London, W1U7 EU, United Kingdom). You will be contacted by them in order to agree a day on which fieldwork can be started and the period during which the auditors will attend your offices and to discuss the preparation of the engagement and any other arrangements to be made by you.

Please note that under the current circumstances related the Covid-19 crisis, it is not clear yet when the field work may take place. A future date for the start of the field work or alternative modalities will be communicated whenever conditions allow it.

In order to ensure that the engagement can be carried out smoothly, I would also expect you to cooperate fully with the audit team and provide all the documents, information, and assistance requested.

Tel: +961 (0) 1 956 900 - Fax: +961 (0) 1 987 780 - E-mail: delegation-lebanon@eeas.europa.eu

WebSite: http://www.eeas.europa.eu/delegations/lebanon

In this respect, please, ensure the necessary arrangements are made in order to allow for this engagement to be performed in a satisfactory way, including the availability of a room or office (which can be locked for security reasons) for the engagement team, access to office equipment such as a photocopier, fax machine, a telephone line and an internet connection, if possible.

I would also like you to inform your staff about this engagement and to ensure their presence during the period of the field work.

Mr. Dionigio Vergallo is the European Commission Audit Task Manager for this engagement. Please do not hesitate to contact him (dionigio.vergallo@eeas.europa.eu) in case you have any further questions on this matter.

Yours faithfully,

Giorgio Pasqualucci

Head of Finance, Contracts and Audit Section

C.c: Mr Tareshma

Mr Tareshma Ptohopoulos (BDO LLP);

Ms Maria Paz Grande Boloque (BDO LLP);



## os تدشین مرکز البیانات الرئیسی فی وزارة العدل والاعلان والاعلان

برعاية دولة رئيس مجلس الوزراء السيد سعد الحريري، قامت وزيرة الدولة لشؤون التنمية الإدارية الدكتورة مي شدياق ووزير العدل القاضي البرت سرحان ورئيس مجلس القضاء الأعلى القاضي جان فهد ورئيسة بعثة الاتحاد الاوروبي السيدة كريستينا لاسن بتدشين مركز البيانات الرئيسي في وزارة العدل والاعلان عن انتهاء اعمال مكننة محكمة التمييز المدنية ومباشرة مكننة باقي المحاكم. تجدر الاشارة الى ان هذا المشروع مموّل من الاتحاد الاوروبي بقيمة حوالي 8 ملايين يورو، جرى ذلك خلال احتفال رسمي في قصر عدل بيروت بحضور مدير عام وزارة العدل بالانابة القاضية هيلانة اسكندر، رئيس هيئة التفتيش القضائي القاضي بركان سعد ونقيب المحامين الاستاذ اندريه شدياق بالاضافة إلى ممثلى الهيئات الرقابية، والقضائية والأمنية.

بداية، كانت كلمة للقاضي فهد حيث اعتبر أن " التحول الرقمي يشكل أحد الأعمدة الرئيسية لتطوير العدالة وبدونه لن يكون هناك تحول في أدائها، وأن مصلحة المتقاضي هي في جوهر أي تغيير في وسائل عمل القضاء" واعربت لاسن عن سرورها للمشاركة في هذا الحفل الرسمي للإعلان عن إنتهاء أعمال مكننة محكمة التمييز والمباشرة بمشروع مكننة باقي المحاكم، بتمويل من الاتحاد الأوروبي وذلك إنفاذاً لسياسة الجوار التي تنتهجها أوروبا مع الدول المحيطة بها والدول الصديقة ومنها لبنان في إطار مسار تاريخي عريق من الشراكة والتعاون بين الجانبين

على الصعد كافة ومنها قطاع القضاء. واشارت لاسن في كلمتها الى أن إنجاز هذا المشروع يؤكد على أهمية تطوير التعاون في المنظومة القضائية، من خلال العديد من البرامج، ما يسهم في مساعدة لبنان على مكافحة الفساد وتعزيز استقلالية السلطة القضائية ،منوهة

عدد الله الله الدولة اللبنانية لتعزيز فعالية النظام القضائي اللبناني وكفاءاته. بالجهود التي تبذلها الدولة اللبنانية لتعزيز فعالية النظام القضائي اللبناني وكفاءاته.

أما شدياق فقد اعتبرت أن " هذا المشروع هو استثناءٌ بأهميّتِه وافادته، وهو يساهمُ بكلّ ما نطمحُ إليه من تعزيز الكفاءة والشفافية في العمل القضائي، مكافحةِ الفساد وتطبيق قانون الحق في الوصول إلى المعلومات وذلك عبر تخفيفِ الاحتكاك بين ممثلي فرقاء الدعوى وموظفي المحاكم، تسريع وتفعيل العمل القضائي من خلال تخفيفِ عددِ الملفات الورقية المتداولة والاعتماد على النُسخ الإلكترونية وأخيراً تطبيق سلطة القضاء بفعالية عبر تأمين الربط والتبادل البيني بين المحاكم والإدارات العامّة."

كماً تابعت وحرصًا علَى إستمرارية وديمومة العمل بهذين المشروعيْن الهاميْن خاصةً نُظُمَ المكننة ومركزيْ البيانات والبنية التحتية والتجهيزات كافةً، كلُّنا أمل وثقة بأن وزارةَ العدل ومجلسَ القضاء الأعلى سيعمدان إلى إيجاد السبل الآيلة لتأمين مستلزماتِ الإستمرار والنجاح، وخاصةً إستمراريةَ العنصر البشري التقني والمتخصص لإدارةِ هذه المراكز والبنية التحتية المعلوماتية والنُظُم. ونحن كوزارة تنمية اداريّة، مستعدّون للمساعدةِ والدعم في اكمالِ المشروع وضمانِ استمراريّته، وأتمنّى من الاتحاد الأوروبي وسفيرته الصديقة كريستينا لاسن مشكورة سلفا إستكمالَ المرحلة الأولى عبر المساهمة في إطلاق المرحلة الثانية نظراً لأهميّةِ مشروعنا على المستوى الوطنيّ." من جهته اعتبر سرحان أن " برنامج مكننة المحاكم المنفذ بإدارة مكتب وزير الدولة لشؤون التنمية الإدارية وبالشراكة مع وزارة العدل ومجلس القضاء الأعلى وبتمويل من الإتحاد الأوروبي يشكل نموذجًا على نجاح تعاون إدارات عامة مختلفة مع جهة مانحة في إدخال تكنولوجيا المعلومات إلى أكثر الإدارات تعقيدًا في الإجراءات، ألا وهي المحاكم، وهذا النموذج يقتضي أن يعمّم على سائر الإدارات العامة. فالتخطيط المنفرد لا يمكن أن يعطي نتائج كافية في ميدان التكنولوجيا الرقمية."

وأضاف أن "مشروع مكننة أعمال المحاكم خطا أولى خطواته العملية بنجاح في محكمة التمييز وسيتم تعميمه على سائر المحاكم خصوصًا في مراكز المحافظات، وسأعمل جاهدًا على تحقيق هذا الأمر." تخلل الحفل فيلم قصير عن أهمية المشروع بالاضافة الى عرض تقنى.

04	omsar3- <b>[]</b> 72019-(1).jpg	omsar2- <b>[</b> 0472019.jpg	omsar1- 0472019-(1).jpg





# The European Union for Courts' Automation and Introducing More Transparency and Better Access to Justice Services in Lebanon



During an event held at the Judicial Palace of Beirut On 3 July 2019 the European Union marked the successful completion of the civil cassation courts' automation, automation of remaining courts and inauguration of the data centre at the Ministry of Justice. The event under the Patronage of the President of the Council of Ministers, His Excellency Saad Hariri, saw the participation of the Minister of Justice Judge Albert Serhan, Minister of State for Administrative Reform Dr May Chidiac, EU Ambassador Christina Lassen and the President of the Higher Judicial Council Judge Jean Fahed, and gathered key stakeholders from the judicial sector in Lebanon.

EU Ambassador Christina Lassen emphasized that the EU invested almost 8 Million Euro for the automation of courts in Lebanon which is aimed to make the Lebanese judicial system more efficient, effective, transparent, accountable and independent vis a' vis the citizens that it serves. She stressed that "All this is to support the Lebanese government's reform agenda to build a modern and integrated justice system which is able to deliver better services to its citizens".

Services	125978	Technical Assistance and Support to Municipalities in Fields of Local Development at Various Municipal Group	Icon - Institute Is	Various municipalities	International Restricted Tender	464,912	EUR	Closed
Supply	126069	Supply & Installation of Signs'Signaletiques' in 12 Municipal Groups"	Via Liban	12 municipal groups	Competitive Negotiated procedure	111,002	EUR	Closed
Services	MED/2005/17-554/13/07	Cooperation Decentralisee aupres des Collectivites Locales Libanaises	CGLU	Various municipalities	Competitive Negotiated procedure	97,074	EUR	Closed
Services	MED/2005/17-554/17/07	Communication strategies	Memac Ogilvy & Mather s.a.l.	OMSAR+ Municipalities	Competitive Negotiated procedure	144,500	EUR	Closed
Works	MED/2005/17-554/19/07	REHABILITATION AND REFURBISHMENT of Ten Local Development Offices	Construction Services Company sarl	Aley, Bent Jbeil, Chouf Sweijani, Haut Chouf, Haut Metn, Hermel, Jezzine, Keserwane, Sahl, & Zghorta	Open Tender	279,819	EUR	Closed
Supply	MED/2005/17-554/20/07	Supply of office furniture for various municipalities and beneficiaries	FORMETAL	Various municipalities	Open Tender	19,550	EUR	Closed
Services	MED/2005/17-554/22/08	Design and production of Atlas cartographique at 16 municipal clusters in Lebanon	GIS Transport, Ltd	16 municipalities	Competitive Negotiated procedure	47,614	EUR	Closed
Services	MED/2005/17-554/25/08	Provision of Airline Tickets and Hotel Reservation for 2 study tours in France	Damour Tour	Various municipalities	Framework contract	7,972	EUR	Closed
Services	Multiple	Staff & Experts	Staff & Experts	Various municipalities	Multi Methods	1,046,272	EUR	Closed
Services	NA	Offices renting	STARCO	OMSAR	Direct Selection/Contracting	88,400	EUR	Closed
Grant by: EU ; Cod	e: ENPI/2007/18-882; Progr	am: LOGO-II						
Donor Category	Contract Code	Contract Title / Description	Supplier	Beneficiary	Tender method	Net Final Value	Currency	Remarks
Grant	LOGO II/01/09	Local development project	Hermel	Hermel	As per Financing agreement	357,152	EUR	Recovery ongoing by
Grant	LOGO II/02/09	Local development project	Journeh (Akkar)	Joumeh (Akkar)	As per Financing agreement	479,627	EUR	the EU Closed
Grant	LOGO II/03/09	Local development project	Jezzine	Jezzine	As per Financing agreement	954,537	EUR	Closed
Grant	LOGO II/04/09	Local development project	Bint Jbeil (Aitaroun)	Bint Jbeil (Aitaroun)	As per Financing agreement	1,068,525	EUR	Closed
Grant	LOGO II/05/09	Local development project	Sahl	Sahl	As per Financing agreement	747,739	EUR	Closed
Grant	LOGO II/06/09	Local development project	Rayfoun	Rayfoun	As per Financing agreement	584,229	EUR	Closed
Grant	LOGO II/07/09	Local development project	Haut Chouf	Haut Chouf	As per Financing agreement	677,232	EUR	Closed
Grant	LOGO II/08/09	Local development project	Zgharta	Zgharta	As per Financing agreement	383,217	EUR	Recovery ongoing by the EU
Grant	LOGO II/09/09	Local development project	Iqlim el Toufah	Iqlim el Toufah	As per Financing agreement	808,747	EUR	Closed
Grant	LOGO II/10/09	Local development project	Chouf Sweijani	Chouf Sweijani	As per Financing agreement	642,947	EUR	Closed
Grant	LOGO II/11/09	Local development project	Aley	Aley	As per Financing agreement	450,168	EUR	Closed
Grant	LOGO II/12/09	Local development project	Haut Metn	Haut Metn	As per Financing agreement	496,516	EUR	Closed
Grant by: EU; Code	e: ENPI/2008/019-622; Prog	ram: Ministry of Justice						
Donor Category	Contract Code	Contract Title / Description	Supplier	Beneficiary	Tender method	Net Final Value	Currency	Remarks
Services	ENPI/2012/304-541	Design and Provision of software applications	Intertech Batinorm	Ministry of Justice	International restricted Tender	4,419,502	EUR	Under review by the EU
Supply	ENPI/2012/307-786	Install and Setup a Data Center	Data Consult	Ministry of Justice	International Open Tender	3,205,907	EUR	Under review by the EU
Training	ENPI/2012/307-810	Capacity building	JCI	Ministry of Justice	International restricted Tender	774,388	EUR	Closed
Grant by: EU; Code Governance	e: ENPI/2010/021-844; Prog	ram: Policy Planning &						
Donor Category	Contract Code	Contract Title / Description	Supplier	Beneficiary	Tender method	Net Final Value	Currency	Remarks
Services	2013/327-618	Strengthening Human Resources Management Capacity in the Lebanese Public Sector	PLANET	various	International Restricted Tender	1,781,531	EUR	Closed
Services	2013/327-622	Technical Support for the Modernisation of Public Procurement in Lebanon	PLANET	various	International Restricted Tender	1,593,027	EUR	Closed
Services	2014/348-279	Technical Assistance for Administrative Simplification in Selected Ministries	ACE - AECOM	various	International Restricted Tender	1,935,610	EUR	Closed
Services	2014/349-155	Technical Assistance to the Strengthening of Strategic Planning Capacities in Selected Ministries	GFA	various	International Restricted Tender	1,121,159	EUR	Closed
Services	2014/353-368	Communication &Visibility	Memac-Ogilvy	various	Competitive Negotiated procedure	100,000	EUR	Closed



#### Mo.I Master Plan

An Initial Master Plan was conducted during 2005-2007. The global objective of the Initial Master Plan was to develop plans for the enhancement and development of the judiciary sector through the utilization of a comprehensive ICT framework. The Initial Master Plan was envisaged as the strategic document by the Government of Lebanon that shall ensure the overall development of the judiciary ICT infrastructure and required systems for this sector. This should allow the sector to reach effective modern standards in terms of judicial dossier/document management, archiving, decision making and final rulings.

However, the Initial Master Plan did not provide the required analysis and design to proceed with the development or the adaptation of the software applications as per the requirements and needs of the MoJ. Therefore, the Initial Master Plan was restructured and redeveloped in summer 2008 and resulted in the definition of several new projects. The latter became the new Global Master Plan that has identified specific projects with the main objective of analyzing, designing and implementing new software applications for MoJ, as well as updating the initial Master Plan's recommended technological architecture. For further reference, a summary of the history of the Master Plan is provided in annex 2.

## IT Unit of the Ministry of Justice

Recently, the MoJ was working on further steps towards modernizing the judicial system by strengthening the existing available Information Technologies (ITs). The mandate of the IT Unit, as stated by the decree 4168, includes the automation of courts, administration and the directorate general of the MoJ, as well as the training of judges, clerks and ministry's employees on the information technologies.

In line with the initial Master Plan for automation, the MoJ appointed a supervisor judge of the IT Unit in the MoJ. The appointed judge is a specialist in legal informatics, holding a Ph.D. in Law (Legal Informatics) with a B.Sc. in Computer and Communication Engineering.

In addition, the Council of Ministers has approved to recruit a number of IT technicians to staff the Unit (3 programmers, 2 maintenance technicians, and 25 data entry staff members). The procedure for recruitment has already started.

#### **MoJ Current ICT Environment**

In a period of increasingly tight budgets and ever expanding caseloads as well as needs for reforms, the Lebanese Ministry of Justice ought to revert to automation as a way to relatively reduce the considerable demands of handling physical case files and to reduce the long term costs of storing official documents.

A major thrust in that direction has been the ongoing aim of automating the judiciary procedures in the MoJ courts initiated by setting up a Master Plan.

A series of small scale automation efforts have taken place across the past years. Annex 3 details all current ICT applications at the MoJ.

The required services of this project should take into consideration the existing applications in a way not to create further ICT islands at the MoJ. The final outcome of the project's deliverables should result in a robust, coherent and effective ICT application design that will support the MoJ in its daily work.

#### **OMSAR**

The mission of OMSAR is to lead in "Bringing the Lebanese post-war public administration into the 21st century through an **optimal** and **coherent** introduction of **Institutional Development** (rehabilitation and reform) and Information Technology (systems and communications) measures that render streamlined, transparent and traceable processes fulfilled by productive civil servants for the benefit of both the general public and government."

In serving its mission, OMSAR has been very active in supporting the public administrations in a wide variety of modernization projects and ensuring the development of Modern Management Capacities in the public administration through the implementation, and supervision of many automated back office applications (Workflow Systems, Document Management Systems, Financial applications, Human Resource Management Systems and others). For further information, Annex 4 provides details on OMSAR's current work and other planned projects at the MoJ.

## 1.5. Related programmes and other donor activities

#### EU

The EU is the main donor in the justice sector. Up to now the EU has concentrated its support in the following areas: training, access to justice and automation. Further support is foreseen in 2012 to strengthen the independence of the judiciary.

Training, The Justice Professionalisation Project, budgeted at EUR 2.6 million and running since late 2007 until March 2012, implemented in cooperation with the Lebanese Ministry of Justice, Judicial Training Institute (JTI), and the Bar Association of Beirut has been evaluated as a valuable project which lies in the mainstream of the judicial training and reform trend at international level reaching a large number of final beneficiaries (over 3000 professionals of the judiciary). The overall objective of the project is to enhance the capacity of the Ministry of Justice to ensure the efficient performance of the Lebanese Judiciary as well as upgrading the qualifications of all actors in the judicial system. The Specific Objectives are 1) the support provided for the professionalization of judicial actors and 2) the institutional strengthening of the Ministry of Justice and the Bar of Beirut. Further training to the judiciary and private practitioners is foreseen in 2012.

Data Center and Infrastructure Technical Specification Definition Study, Under the Financing Agreement covering this contract, a specific study will be launched for identifying the necessary specifications of the Data Center and Infrastructure related to the successful automation of the operations of the judicial courts of Lebanon, and to prepare the complete tender file including the technical specifications for the actual acquisition of the Data Center and Infrastructure for the courts of Beirut and the backup/disaster recovery location. The study will update the documents that were originally provided through the initial master plan.

Access to justice, implemented with UNDP budgeted at EUR 1.1 M to improve access to information, reinforce legal aid and provide capacity building to MoJ.

Support to security sector, including capacity to enforce the rule of law, particularly in criminal investigations and fight against organised crime (project "Security and Rule of Law", 4M Euro).

*Independence of the Judiciary*, the next EU funded project to be launched in 2012 will target the independence of the judiciary working with the judiciary institutions closely linked to independence such as the High Council for the Judiciary, the State Council, the Institute for Judicial Studies and the Judicial Inspection.

The UNDP has placed a unit within the MoJ to improve access to justice for the citizens, work on the availability of legal documentation to judges, and to support the MoJ to achieve a more human-rights based administration of justice.

**Regarding coordination,** a mechanism, chaired by the MoJ, was put in place for the justice sector and is coordinated and managed by the UNDP in order to coordinate the efforts of the donor community and to exchange information about present and previous projects.

## **Other Donors**

Concerning other donors, most of the Member States concentrate their support to punctual specific training programmes and ad hoc expertise exchange with judiciary staff. France has been very active in this sense. Italy has recently funded IDLO to put in place a training project (500.000€) targeting improving of case flow management and specialised training in specific areas such as cybercrime. USAID made until end of 2010 significant efforts for refurbishing the premises of the JSI, organising workshops and study tours on judicial independence, assessing the backlog of cases and overall case management, assessing legal aid mechanisms as well as improving strategic planning in the MoJ.

## 2. OBJECTIVE, PURPOSE & EXPECTED RESULTS

#### 2.1. Overall objective

The overall objective of the project of which this contract will be part is as follows: is to support the consolidation of the Rule of law and the respect of human rights in Lebanon. The specific objective is to support the Lebanese Justice in its endeavours for modernisation and to increase the efficiency, credibility and capacity of the judiciary system in Lebanon.

#### 2.2. Purpose

The purpose of this contract is as follows: to develop the software applications needed to automate the operations of all the judicial courts of Lebanon, as well as to deploy these software applications across all the Beirut courts.

#### 2.3. Results to be achieved by the Consultant

The expected results to be achieved from accomplishing this contract are summarized as follows:

- Development of the software applications' design specifications; as well as the development and/or acquisition and customization of the software applications;
- Validation and Update of Technical Specifications (TS) to cater for the acquisition of the required hardware, network and other infrastructure systems; as well as participation and assistance in supervising the deployment of the acquired systems.
- Deployment of the software applications at the Beirut Courts including IT and functional training; as well as warranty and on-site support and update activities.

The software applications are expected to comprise at least a Case Management System, a Document Management and Archiving System, as well as business productivity applications.

## 3. ASSUMPTIONS & RISKS

## 3.1. Assumptions underlying the project intervention

- 1. OMSAR with the cooperation of the MoJ will be committed to the successful execution of this project and taking it forward to meet the Master plan objectives.
- 2. The MoJ's management will support this project and take active steps to modify or simplify courts' procedures where and when needed.
- 3. The MoJ will assign a counterpart team that will work closely with the Consultant and OMSAR's team.
- 4. The MoJ will work strongly in close coordination with OMSAR and the consultant to expedite deliverables review and approval.
- 5. The IT unit at MoJ will be expanded, staffed and provided with sufficient budget to carry on with the operations and future management of enhancements of the judicial software system.
- 6. Offices in Beirut will be rehabilitated (furnished with necessary furniture, space, physical security...) in order to ensure an effective implementation of automation.

7.

#### 3.2. Risks

The consultant is required to be aware of the possible risks involved in implementing this project and is hereby expected to develop risk management plans to mitigate those risks that may jeopardize the successful completion of the project. Some of those risks may be identified as:

- 1. Potential inability of existing personnel to comprehend and adapt to the purpose of the project leading to major obstacles in gathering the required information and thus hindering the project implementation and utilization. This can be circumvented by careful and sufficient attention to the consultant's approach to the user base that will ease the communication and the eventual automation.
- 2. Legal limitation (existing laws, decrees or circulars) that might underlie the suggested design and the implementation of the automated systems. Any changes, enhancements or others need to be carefully studied with the MoJ respective team.
- 3. Approvals and feedback caught up in Government bureaucracy.
- 4. Civil unrest leading to project interruption. Suitable changes to the project plan shall be accompanied by implemented Change Control Procedures.
- 5. Resistance from MoJ's employees. Consensus building in the early project stages, close coordination during design and proper organizational change management will respond to this issue.

## 4. SCOPE OF THE WORK

#### 4.1.General

#### 4.1.1. Description of the assignment

This assignment aims to automate the operations and procedures of the judicial, administrative and special courts, as well as their related administrations within the Ministry of Justice of Lebanon. The assignment encompasses the definition of the specifications of the business software applications, the development and/or acquisition and customization of these applications as per the defined specifications, as well as, the deployment and implementation of these business software applications in the courts of Beirut.

The components of this project are outlined as such:

- Define and develop (the business software applications') requirements, functionalities, specifications and related designs needed to automate the processes of the courts;
- Verify and Update of a supply Technical Specifications that will cater for the acquisition of the needed Hardware, Network and computer systems infrastructure and other necessary requirements that will ensure proper automation implementation;
- Supervise the deployment, installation and testing of the hardware and infrastructure systems that will be procured by the supply technical specifications mentioned in point 2 above;
- Development and/or acquisition and customization of the business software applications as per the developed specifications and designs provided in point 1 above;
- Deployment, testing and implementation of the software business applications at the Beirut Courts;
- IT and functional training for the systems' users and administrators; and
- Warranty and On-site support.

The automation systems are expected to comprise at least a Case Management System, a Document Management and Archiving System, as well as business productivity applications involving collaboration, calendaring, notifications and scheduling systems as required by the operation of the courts of the Ministry of Justice.

The following is a definition of the scope of the processes to be automated. The detailed scope of the judiciary processes are as described in Lebanese Laws. The scope of the design of judiciary processes in MoJ is the following:

- 1. The Civil Courts Process:
- 2. The Criminal Courts Process;
- 3. The Administrative Courts Process;
- 4. The Enforcement Courts Process; and
- 5. The Special Courts Processes.

Annex 5 provides a broad description of each of the above processes. The workflow of these processes as they are currently executed is described in detail in the Initial Master Plan (Function and Procedures Workflow Analysis Report). A detailed description in Arabic (using the official steps and terminologies) of these processes and their workflow will be provided to the consultant upon project launching.

#### 4.1.2. Geographical area to be covered

This activity will be carried out in Lebanon.

## 4.1.3. Target groups

The target groups are all actors involved with the administration of justice, notably the Ministry of Justice (as well as other Ministries with close links with the justice administration) the judiciary institutions, the judiciary staff and ultimately the Lebanese citizens. Annex 6 provides a preliminary list of identified stakeholders.

## 4.2. Specific activities

It is up to the consultant to prepare their own detailed organisation and methodology and technical proposals such that they fulfill the general requirements described in these Terms of Reference

The Consultant is free to propose all aspects of their detailed methodology and work plan for the assignment in their proposal. However, it is envisaged that the project will be structured in a phased manner represented through the following 9 phases. The phases are not necessarily sequential and some may be conducted in parallel:

- Phase 1: Preliminary Activities;
- Phase 2: Requirements Analysis;
- Phase 3: Software Applications Design;
- Phase 4: Verify/Update /Supervise the necessary Infrastructure and Supply TOR;
- Phase 5: Develop/Customize Courts' automation Software Applications;
- Phase 6: Deploy, Test and Implement software applications at Beirut Courts;
- Phase 7: Training and Guide Documentation;
- Phase 8: Project Operational Acceptance; and
- Phase 9: Warranty and Technical Support

#### **4.2.1.** Phase 1: Preliminary Activities

*Background:* MoJ has already conducted a major study that resulted in the development of an Initial Master Plan and a Global Plan (as explained in section 1.5 above). Much work went into the research for the Master and global Plan. Areas related to functional requirements, descriptions of workflows, definition of procedures and processes, training plan, risk analysis, as well as surveys related to physical resources, user spread and count requirements were tackled.

Requested Activities: The main activities of this phase:

- Identify project stakeholders;
- Organize of a kick-off meeting of the project;
- Collect, identify and analyze documentation and information;







## **Courts Automation**



ENPI/2012/304-541

## **Final Report**

Ref. REP 75 – B – Final Report

Prepared by	Project Coordinator/ Quality Controller
Validated by	Team Leader
Approved By	Project Director

REP No.	75	Sent on	Comment received on
Version	Α	7 Oct. 2019	11 Oct 2019
	В	11 Oct 2019	11 Oct 2019 Approved





## **Table of Contents**

Τ.	ilitroduction	5
	Project Objective	
	Final Report Objectives	
	Background	
	Encountered Problems	
	Changes to the main Scope of the Project	
	Sustainability Process	
	Monitoring and Evaluation	
	Awareness and Visibility	
	Concluding Remarks	





## 1. Introduction

## A. Project Objective

The courts Automation project entails the delivery of a Case Management System including a billing module, a Document Management and Archiving System, as well as business productivity applications involving collaboration, calendaring and notifications.

The aim of this project is to provide business applications to be used for the automation of the operations of all judicial courts across Lebanon, with implementation limited at this time to the Beirut, Jdeideh and Jounieh Courts.

Such automation will improve the set of actions that a court takes to monitor and control the progress of cases. It will also allow, in the future, access to information to the public in courts, lawyers and judges via the internet.

## **B. Final Report Objectives**

The purpose of the Final Report is to describe the project background, encountered problems, as well as sustainability and awareness strategies to ensure adequate and continuous usage of the implemented software applications as the core functioning tool of the courts.

## 2. Background

The Courts Automation Project, funded by the European Delegation (EUD) and managed by the Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform (OMSAR), was launched on the 2<sup>nd</sup> of November 2012 to support the Justice sector in Lebanon through the provision of software applications and tools for automating all civil, criminal, execution, administrative and special courts procedures.

Given the high number of courts' procedures to automate and the delays in the validation of the phases deliverables; and in order to ensure an adequate analysis, design and testing for a scalable solution, and to implement the new requirements and enhancements



identified by the Ministry of Justice, the contract duration has been extended till the 1st of September 2019.

At the early stages of this project, the beneficiary was the Ministry of Justice (MOJ) represented by its IT Unit. The latter was involved in all analysis, design, deployment and testing phases to ensure the adequacy of the provided software applications on both functional and technical levels.

Upon launching the operation phase, the Higher Judicial Council was officially declared as the beneficiary of the Courts Automation Project, taking into consideration its administrative and governance role in managing courts.

The Courts Automation Solution is, till the date of submission of this report, operational in all services of the Civil and Criminal Cassation Courts, and is ready to be used in any other court in Lebanon.

## 3. Encountered Problems

During this project, several problems occurred and prompted intervention from the EUD, Contracting Authority, Beneficiary and Consultant. Different meetings took place to solve the issues and ensure the continuity and success of the project. Among these problems we mention:

- Resistance from courts' personnel during requirements analysis, training and operation phases,
- Inconsistency and gaps between the law procedures and the actual working methodology in the different courts,
- Most courts use unofficial personal forms created by the clerks and judges in their daily case management work, which required a lot of effort for standardization,
- Delay in validation and decision making from the beneficiaries,
- Delay in project implementation due to construction and rehabilitation works at the Judiciary Palace of Beirut,



- Delay in beneficiary securing connectivity between the two main centers (Data Center and Disaster Recovery Center),
- Delay in Data Center and Hardware Project Implementation.

Annex A provides the risk and issue logs of the project that summarize all the encountered risks and issues along with their mitigation measures.

## 4. Changes to the main Scope of the Project

The below changes to the main scope of the project has been agreed on in different addendums:

- Addendum no 1, dated on the 7th of December 2012, addition of Phase 10 Awareness and Visibility Campaign to the scope of the project,
- Addendum no 3, dated on the 29<sup>th</sup> of May 2018:
  - O During the EU mid-term evaluation mission that took place in January 2018, the EU evaluators raised the risk of association of the CMS and DMS since IBM will stop their support to the implemented products in 2018, the support of some components of the DMS bundle installed and configured at the Ministry of Justice will not be able to be secured,

Further to the EU evaluators' input, the Consultant, OMSAR and MOJ agreed on the dissociation of the CMS and the IBM Filenet (DMS), as follows:

- In addition to the features related to cases management, the CMS will remain integrated with the developed customized scanning interface, and will allow users to attach documents to case objects (event, billing and decision). The documents attached to the CMS cases will be stored in the CMS File System instead of IBM DMS, and will only be accessible by the CMS for security purposes,
- On the other hand, the IBM Filenet Solution deployed at the Ministry of Justice, will be used by the HJC/MOJ's users as a standalone application to store and manage various types of documents for digitalization or archival or as they deem necessary.





- Phase 11 Quality Control of the minor new requirements was added. The aim
  of this phase is to review the minor new requirements that will be implemented
  by the HJC/MOJ IT Team,
- Phase 12 Major new requirements implementation was added. The aim of this
  phase is to add and implement major new requirements requested by the
  beneficiary. These requirements were not identified during the phases of
  Analysis and Design,
- Phase 7 Training Phase scope was modified as follows:
  - PHP Training (2 days).
  - ICT Literacy Training "on-the-go" or "on-demand" in coordination with OMSAR and MOJ for a duration of 1 year instead of 4.5 months mentioned in the TOR in order to provide flexibility to trainees,
  - CMS Parameterization Training (13 days),
  - Technical Training on the CMS, to the HJC/MOJ's technical personnel (up to 6 persons) (5 days),
  - Technical Training on the CMS customization, statistics and dashboards to the HJC/MOJ's technical personnel (up to 6 persons) (5 days),
  - Technical Training to the HJC/MOJ's technical personnel (up to 6 persons), to cover the DMS administration, Collaboration software administration and other technical aspects such as certificates renewal, etc.,
  - 10 days "Train the Trainer" Training to the HJC/MOJ technical personnel / trainers (up to 10 persons), allowing them to provide functional training to all courts users and as such secure continuity and sustainability,
  - In addition to the above the Consultant provided 2 months of Parameterization Handover Training.





## 5. Sustainability Process

Since the beginning of the Courts Automation Project and despite all the encountered challenges, the Consultant has always taken into consideration, during all phases, the continuity and sustainability of the project.

In fact, during the analysis and design phases, the Consultant has defined and analyzed the procedures of all civil, criminal, execution, administrative and special courts. Based on the conducted analysis, the Consultant has standardized the judiciary procedures and templates across all courts.

Further to the above, the Consultant ensured establishing a scalable design on both infrastructure and application levels, to ensure the adoption of a single solution for all courts in Lebanon.

Moreover, the Consultant submitted a proposal for modifications document which included its recommendation on legal, procedural, logistical and technical levels.

During the development phase, the Consultant ensured that the provided software applications are scalable as per the design documents. At the end of this phase, and as part of its deliverables, the Consultant provided the Source code which allows the beneficiary to implement in the future any identified enhancement / additional functionality. 3000 licenses were also provided for business productivity software applications. This number of licenses exceeds the number of personnel at Beirut, Jdeideh and Jounieh courts. Thus, these licenses can be used for operating courts in other regions.

During the deployment and testing phase, the Consultant worked in deep cooperation with the beneficiary to ensure their involvement in the deployment, installation and testing process. Moreover, the Consultant has provided full step by step deployment and installation guides enabling the beneficiary to make any future needed installation and configuration.





During the training phase, in addition to the end user training, the Consultant provided extra technical and parameterization training sessions. Extensive Technical training sessions were delivered to the beneficiary's technical personnel and Train the Trainer training to the beneficiary's appointed trainers allowing them to manage, administer and configure the provided applications, and to provide training and support to the courts' users.

During the operational acceptance phase, the Consultant supported and assisted the Higher Judicial Council in the operation of two services of the Cassation Courts with all their services (a total of 10 services). The Higher Judicial Council personnel were involved in the entire operation process from courts and services initiation and operation, to enhancements implementation and software tailoring and configuration.

Moreover, the Consultant submitted a roll out plan detailing the steps and priorities needed for the operation of other courts and services across Lebanon.

During phase 11 of the project, the Consultant has provided quality control services and assisted the HJC team in the implementation of the minor new requirements for a period of 6 months. Moreover, the Consultant has assisted the HJC team and courts' users in the initialization and operation of several services of the civil and criminal cassation courts.

During phase 12, the Consultant has developed, deployed and tested major new requirements as described in addendum no 3 of the project. Moreover, the Consultant has provided the HJC with training and know how transfer sessions on the newly developed functionalities.

During the support phase, the Consultant has provided both functional and technical support to ensure the smooth operation of the courts and the success of the project. In fact, The Consultant's support personnel were present onsite in the Judicial Place of Beirut every working day to ensure fast troubleshooting and solving to any encountered issue or fault in the software applications. Moreover, the Consultant's support team offered support and guidance to courts' personnel in the usage of the provided software





applications to achieve their daily work, and conducted informal training sessions to the clerks and judges using the system. On the other hand, the Consultant has conducted several informal capacity building and know how transfer sessions to the HJC's personnel on CMS customization, courts initialization and statistics configuration.

## 6. Monitoring and Evaluation

In order to ensure the success of the project, it is recommended that the beneficiary conduct continuous monitoring of the below indicators:

- Number of automated courts in the different regional locations
- Number of automated services
- Number of trained users
- Number of users using the applications
- Number of automated cases
- Average time to set a trial date (from date of case initiation)
- Number of hearings per case and the outcome of it
- Average time for ruling in a case (from date of case initiation till end or transfer to another court)
- Percentage of cases in the court system longer ("older") than established timeframes
- Average money expenditures per case
- Number of Decisions issued per case

The above indicators and the statistical reports generated from the system will allow the Higher Judicial Council to evaluate the achievements and to take decisions for operation enhancement to ensure project continuity and better decision making.





## 7. Awareness and Visibility

The Consultant has applied the EU visibility guidelines throughout the different phases of the Courts Automation project.

In fact, during the first phases of the project (Inception, Analysis and Design), the Consultant highlighted to the different met stakeholders that this project is funded by the EU and has raised its importance to improve the Justice sector in Lebanon.

Moreover, the Consultant mentioned on the first page of each deliverable (for all phases) that this project is funded by the EU (with EU logo) and managed by OMSAR (Please refer to image in Annex B).

The Consultant also added the EU logo and mentioned that the Courts Automation project is an EU funded project on the main screen of the application which will be available at any operating court across Lebanon (Please refer to image in Annex C) and on the production website developed as part of the awareness and visibility campaign phase (phase 10) which can be accessible to the public (Please refer to image in Annex D).

In addition to the above, the Consultant emphasized during the different trainings, to the different users (end-users, trainers and technical personnel); that the EU is supporting the Justice sector in Lebanon through funding different projects. Among these projects, the Courts Automation aims to enhance the productivity and to improve the performance of the courts through the automation of the staff daily work.

Moreover, the Consultant has clearly mentioned that the Courts Automation project was funded by the EU and managed by OMSAR on all material and items produced as part of the awareness and visibility pre-implementation and post-implementation phases, which were used in the project launching ceremony and in the project closure event.





In fact, as part of the awareness and visibility pre-implementation phase, the Consultant has implemented the below activities:

Item No.	Activity	Туре	Phase	Specifications	
A1	Project Management & Reporting	Expert	Phase I - PRE- implementation	Campaign Coordinator, full time for 3 months	
A2	Project Management & Reporting	General Fees	Phase I - PRE- implementation	Project Management: Including other Expert, judiciary experts which will be in charge of producing the necessary contents to be diffused and published in the different events, activities and medias	
A3	Design Activity	Logo / Slogan	Phase I - PRE- implementation	Logo concept and design and slogan creation All design original electronic files are the property of the beneficiary	
A4		Design & Layout	Phase I - PRE- implementation	Posters, Calendar & Flyer design All design original electronic files are the property of the beneficiary	
			Phase I - PRE- implementation	Design and Artwork of additional material for both phases	
A7	Supply and Distribution Activities	Flyer	Phase I - PRE- implementation	Flyer, Arabic, foldable design, A4, 4-color, recto/verso, 170 gr. coated paper (Pre-implementation)	
A9	Media	Press Release s	Phase I - PRE- implementation	Information Press Release to all newspapers, Arabic/French/English	
A10	Other	Launchi ng /Closing Ceremo ny	Phase I - PRE- implementation	Project Launching Ceremony (Ministers, ambassadors and General Directors), including ceremony catering for 500 persons, speaker, waiters service, photographer and invitation cards (Event was conducted in the Beirut BAR's amphitheater booked by the MoJ at no cost)	
			Phase I - PRE- implementation	5 Hostesses to welcome and seat Guests, and distribute printed material	
			Phase I - PRE- implementation	Invitation Cards Distribution	
			Phase I - PRE- implementation	Vinyl Banners for Branding	
			Phase I - PRE- implementation	5 interprets / 100 Infrared receivers	
			Phase I - PRE- implementation	Roll-up Banners	



NETIKS BATINORM

Item No.	Activity	Туре	Phase	Specifications
A11	Other	EU Flag	Phase I - PRE- implementation	EU Flag

On the other hand, as part of the awareness and visibility post-implementation phase, the Consultant has implemented the below activities:

Budget Line as per Annex V	Description	Type	Phase	Specifications
10.b	Promotional items and visibility	Roll-up Banners Mousepads	Phase II- POST- implementation Phase II- POST- implementation Phase II- POST- implementation	Flyer, Arabic, foldable design (3 folds), A4, 4-color, recto/verso, 170 gr. coated paper Roll-up Banners  Mousepads
		Closure event	Phase II- POST- implementation	Project Closing Ceremony (Ministers, ambassadors and General Directors), including ceremony catering for 350 persons and photographers (Location provided by HJC at no cost: the Cassation Court - Beirut)  Event Planning and organization personnel
10.c	Closure Event		implementation Phase II- POST- implementation Phase II- POST- implementation	Invitation Cards and distribution (personally)  Venue Preparation
			Phase II - PRE- implementation	Interpretation
	Other awareness	USB	Phase II- POST- implementation	USB - 8 GB
10.d	activities	Design and Artwork	Phase II- POST- implementation	Design and art work for all material (Flyer, Roll-up Banners, Invitation cards, mousepad, usb)



Production Website		Production Website and Content Management System (CMS)
Production Advertising Spot	Phase II- POST- implementation	Production of a 6 min documentary and video spot

## 8. Concluding Remarks

It is very essential for the beneficiary to closely monitor the work and plan ahead of time on the courts in which the application will be rolled out. Proper planning is need to secure the needed Hardware for the respective courts and the connectivity to the Data Center and Disaster Recovery.

Of paramount importance too, to secure budgets for running costs in order to ensure that the automation environment is sustainable and continuous.

This project has secured for the Judicial Sector in Lebanon an essential pillar towards public trust, transparency and open government, all of which are recommended by the EU to reform the relationship between the citizen and the government at large and enforce the rule of law.





## **Request for Payment of Invoice**

From:

Procurement Unit

To:

Nakhoul Jabbour, Senior Financial Officer

Date:

23/4/2019

Funding Source	Modernization of the Lebanese Justice" No. ENPI/2008/019-622				
Project Title	Courts Automation - Design and Provision of Software Applications and Supervision of Automation Infrastructure Requirements For the Lebanese Ministry of Justice.				
Payment Number	Payment no. 7 ( Interim Payment 9 and 10)				
Technical Manager	Maya Jajeh: ICT Project Manager				
Contract Manager	Aline Saadeh, Procurement Officer				
Contract No. and Date	ENPI/2012/304-541 Dated: 02 NOV 2012				
Contractor	Consortium Intertech- Batinorm SAL and Esabora SAS and Netiks International SAL				
Original Contract Value: 3,920,000 Euro Amended Contract Value - Addendum I: 4,1,92,100 Euro Amended Contract Value - Addendum III: 4,422,100 Eu					

Payments	Invoice no.	Invoice Date	Payment in Euro	Payable Amount in Euro	Status
	P	revious Paymen	ıt		
Interim Payment (1) Due upon approval of phase 1,2 and 3	289/2014-P161	23/JUN/2015 received on 25/JUN/2014	1,170,000	1,170,000	Paid
Interim Payment (2) Due upon approval of phase 5	308/2015-P161	30/MAR/2015 received on 7/APR/2015	1,422,210	1,422,210	Paid
Interim Payment (3) Due upon approval of phase 4	345/2016-P161	29/NOV/2016 received on 30/NOV/2016	162,210	161,610*	Paid
Interim Payment (4) upon approval of phases 6	415/2018-	18/JUL/2018	270,000	270,000	Paid
Interim Payment (5) upon approval of phase 7	P161	23/JUL/2018	216,000	216,000	Paid
Interim Payment (6) upon approval of phase 8	419/2018-P161	7/SEP/2018 received on 7/SEP/2018	180,000	180,000	Paid

/4 B.

Page **1** of **2** 

## **Request for Payment of Invoice**

Current Payment							
Payments	Invoice no.	Invoice Date	Payment in Euro	Payable Amount in Euro			
Interim Payment (9), upon approval of phase 11 Final Report	438/2019-	15/APR/2019	82,080	82,080			
Interim Payment (10) upon approval of phase 12 Final Report	P161	Received on 17/APR/2019	210,600	210,600			
Total	Total Payable Amount for Interim Payments 9 and 10 in Euro						

Procurement Officer	Aline Saadeh Signature 23 April 2019			
Approval Senior Procurement Officer	Youssef Saad Signature 23/4/2019			
Remarks related to previous payments	Interim Payment no. 3: a credit note amounting to 600 Euro has been provided to deduct the relative amount from the respective payment.			
Attachments	<ol> <li>Original Invoice and RFP of IB.</li> <li>Original Acceptance of Deliverables Sheet for Phases 11 and 12 dated 23 APR 2019.</li> <li>Approved Deliverables: Deliverables and Interim/Final Report of phase 11.</li> <li>Approved Deliverables: Deliverables and Interim/Final Report of phase 12.</li> <li>Copy of the FIF.</li> </ol>			
Senior Financial Officer Payment Confirmation or Modification				
Comments if any				



## **INVOICE**

Invoice No: 438/2019-P161

VAT No.: **7896-601** Date: **April 15, 2019** 

To: Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform

**Project:** Courts Automation- Design and Provision of Software Applications and Supervision Of Automation Infrastructure Requirements for the Lebanese Ministry of Justice

Contract reference no: ENPI/2012/304-541

Grant: 100% VAT: 0%

Description	Amount in Euro
Interim payment No. 9 (phase 11: Quality control of the minor new requirements)	82,080
Interim payment No. 10 (phase 12: Major new requirements implementation)	210,600
Amount to be paid through Interim Invoices No. 7	292,680
VAT 0%	0,00

Only two hundred ninety-two thousand, six hundred eighty Euros

Iskandar TALEB
General Manager



## **Acceptance of Deliverables**

## Period of Implementation of contract: From 2 Nov 2012 To 2 Sept 2019

Funding source	EU	
Contract Title	Courts Automation	
Contract No	ENPI/2012/304-541	
Consultant	Intertech-Batinorm/Esabora/Netiks	

In reference to the above mentioned contract, the Intertech-Batinorm/Esabora/Netiks officially submitted to OMSAR the final versions of the following deliverables:

Deliverables Description Under phase 11:					
Type of Deliverables/Name, Doc	Submission Date	Approval Date	Delays (if any) Justification		
DLV 11.1 - A - Phase 11 - Monthly Report 1	3 Oct. 2018	5 Oct. 2019			
DLV 11.2 - A - Phase 11 - Monthly Report 2	12 Nov. 2018	4 Dec. 2018			
DLV 11.3 - B - Phase 11 - Monthly Report 3	10 Dec. 2018	1 Feb. 2019			
DLV 11.4 - A - Phase 11 - Monthly Report 4	9 Jan. 2019	1 Feb. 2019			
DLV 11.5 - B - Phase 11 - Monthly Report 5	31 Jan. 2019	1 Feb. 2019			
DLV 11.6 - A - Phase 11 - Monthly Report 6	4 Mar. 2019	4 Mar. 2019			
DLV 11.7 - A - Phase 11 Interim Report	4 Mar. 2019	26 Mar. 2019			

I confirm the acceptance of the above mentioned deliverables and the successful completion of Phase 11 as per contract terms and conditions.

Name	Title / Role	Representing Institution	Date	Signature
Aline Daher	Analyst/Programmer	HJC	18/4/2019	A.
Rabih Rahbani	DBA	HJC	18/4/2019	Penbu
Maya Jajeh	ICT PM	OMSAR	23/4/219	1
Attachements				
1) All above mentioned deliverables				
Comments				

Acceptance of Deliverables Contract No: ENPI/2012/304-541

## **Acceptance of Deliverables**

Period of Implementation of contract: From 2 Nov 2012 To 2 Dec 2015

Funding source	EU
Contract Title	Courts Automation
Contract No	ENPI/2012/304-541
Consultant	Intertech-Batinorm/Esabora/Netiks

In reference to the above mentioned contract, the Intertech-Batinorm/Esabora/Netiks officially submitted to OMSAR the final versions of the following deliverables:

Deliverables Description Under phase 2:				
Type of Deliverables/Name, Doc	Submission Date	Approval Date	Delays (if any)/Comment	
DLV3.1 CMS/DMS Analysi	S			
FSD Part 6 - Case's Parties Modeling	28/June/2013	3/Mar/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews.  Delay totaling 6.5 months.	
FSD Part 7 - Case's Main Screens Modeling	28/June/2013	28/Apr/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews.  Delay totaling 8 months.	
FSD Part 8 - Seals Management Modeling	28/June/2013	20/Mar/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews.  Delay totaling 7 months.	
FSD Part 9 - Hearings and Decisions Modeling	28/June/2013	28/Apr/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews.  Delay totaling 8 months.	
FSD Part 10 - Events Types Modeling	28/June/2013	4/Mar/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews.  Delay totaling 6.5 months.	

Acceptance of Deliverables
Contract No: ENPI/2012/304-541

Jan Mill.

Alu

R2H0



# The Lebanese Republic Office of the Minister of State for Administrative Reform

FSD Part 11 - Diaries Modeling	28/June/2013	4/Mar/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews. Delay totaling 6.5 months.
FSD Part 12 - National reference tables	28/June/2013	4/Mar/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews.  Delay totaling 6.5 months.
FSD Part 13 - Local Reference tables	28/June/2013	20/Mar/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews. Delay totaling 7 months.
FSD Part 14 - Common functions	16/Sep/2013	4/Mar/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews.  Delay totaling 4.5 months.
DLV3.2- FSD UML Use cas	es and Diagrams		Di an II thoro
FSD Part 1 - CMS Actors and Proposed	15/Feb/2014	18/Mar/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. No delay in approval.
Access Rights Tables  FSD Part 2 - Use Case Diagrams	5/Nov/2013	19/June/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews and introduction of a Higher Judicial Council Committee for further reviews. Delay totaling 6.5 months.
FSD Part 3 - Functionalities' Use Cases	5/Nov/2013	19/June/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews and introduction of a Higher Judicial Council Committee fo further reviews. Delay totaling 6.5 months.
FSD Part 4 - Activity Diagrams	5/Nov/2013	19/June/2014	Due to delay in Phase II there was a delay in submittal. Plus delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews and

Acceptance of Deliverables Contract No: ENPI/2012/304-541

And Alf

Hi Rulling

Page 2 of 4

Deliverables Description Under phase 2:				
Type of Deliverables/Name, Doc	Submission Date	Approval Date	Delays (if any)/Comment	
DLV3.5- Backlog Implementation Plan	18/Mar/2013	1/Aug/2013	No delay in submittal but delay in approval due to needed repeated reviews. Delay totaling 3.5 months.	

I confirm the acceptance of the above mentioned deliverables and the successful completion of Phase 3 as per contract terms and conditions.

Name	Title / Role	Representing Institution	Date	Signature	
Wassim Hajjar	Judge Supervisor of the IT Unit	MOJ	10/7/2014	#24	
Omar Okaily	Head of IT Unit	MOJ	10/7/2014	fifteen	
Aline Daher	Analyst/Programmer	MOJ	10/7/2014	Abro	
Rabih Rahbani	DBA	MOJ	10.7.2.14	R2 Nb2.	
Maya Jajeh	ICT PM	OMSAR	8912016		
Attachements					
1) All above	e mentioned deliverabl	es			
Comments					
ع النون نوبة اع او ايه تعديلات از وربي المدالية المعلومات مند احتاره تو الكالم					
		E7 /21 1-2	C, LA	1 Hele V 22 Cre	

Acceptance of Deliverables
Contract No: ENPI/2012/304-541

Page 4 of 4